



A CMS Energy Company

September 27, 2013

**Via U.S. and Electronic Mail**

Rodger A. Kershner, Esq.  
Howard & Howard Attorneys PC  
450 West Fourth Street  
Royal Oak, MI 48067-2557

CASE NO. U-17429 – THETFORD  
PLANT CERT. OF NECESSITY

Dear Mr. Kershner:

Enclosed are the Company's responses to discovery questions 17429-NCG-CE-295, 296, 298, 307, 308, 309, 314, 315 and 453. The requesting party and all others will be served with the discovery responses by e-mail. These responses are being served in hard copy format only on the requesting party. **NOTE: Confidential** responses No. 295 and 453 are only disclosed to counsel under the terms of the Protective Order and Non-Disclosure Certificates signed by those parties. In an effort to save time in preparing responses to discovery requests, all responses will no longer be notarized.

In providing these responses, the Company does not necessarily concede that the requested information is relevant or material to these proceedings. The Company therefore specifically reserves the right to raise objections to the introduction into evidence, through cross-examination or otherwise, of any material supplied pursuant to a discovery request.

The Company intends to supplement a prior response if it becomes aware of a relevant and material error in the response. The Company also intends to supplement a prior response if it becomes aware that there has been a significant change in circumstances unknown to the requesting party which would substantially alter a prior response in a manner which is material and relevant to this case. However, the Company does not keep prior responses under continuous review.

Enclosed with this transmittal is a copy of your September 25, 2013 interrogatories with our internal numbering system annotated in the margins. This will assist you in cross-referencing and tracking our responses.

Sincerely,

Digitally signed by Jon R.  
Robinson  
Date: 2013.09.27 09:12:35  
-04'00'

Jon R Robinson

General Offices:  
One Energy Plaza  
Jackson, MI 49201

Tel: (517) 788-0550  
Fax: (517) 768-3644

\*Washington Office:  
1730 Rhode Island Ave. N.W.  
Suite 1007  
Washington, DC 20036

Tel: (202) 778-3340  
Fax: (202) 778-3355

Writer's Direct Dial Number: (517) 788-0677  
Writer's E-mail Address:  
raymond.mcquillan@cmsenergy.com

LEGAL DEPARTMENT  
JAMES E BRUNNER  
Senior Vice President  
and General Counsel

JON R ROBINSON  
Vice President and  
Deputy General Counsel  
Utility Law and  
Regulation

CATHERINE M REYNOLDS  
Vice President, Deputy  
General Counsel  
& Corporate Secretary

Melissa M Gleespen  
Eric V. Luoma  
Shelley J Ruckman  
Kimberly C Willson  
Assistant General  
Counsel

David E Barth  
Robert W Beach  
H Richard Chambers  
Neil R Fellows  
Kelly M Hall  
Gary L Kelterborn  
Chantez P Knowles  
Raymond E McQuillan  
Jason M Milstone  
Rhonda M Morris  
Deborah A Moss\*  
Mirce Michael Nestor  
Jeffrey D Pintar  
James D W Roush  
John C Shea  
Scott J Sinkwitz  
Adam C Smith  
Bret A Totoraitis  
Mary Jo Weindorf  
Attorney

CC Hon. Sharon L. Feldman, ALJ (letter only via e-mail)  
Mary Jo Kunkle, Executive Secretary (letter & proof of service via e-file)  
James T. Selecky (via e-mail), jtslecky@consultbai.com (& Hard C of ABATE Reqs)  
Alex Zakem (EM) (via e-mail), AJZakem@integrysenergy.com (& Hard C of All Resp + Disks)  
Jonathan Lesser (EM) (via e-mail), jlesser@continentalcon.com (& Hard C of All Resp + Disks)  
Parties of Record

STATE OF MICHIGAN

BEFORE THE MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of the Application of )  
Consumers Energy Company for )  
Approval of a Certificate of Necessity )  
for the Thetford Generating Plant )  
pursuant to MCL 460.6s and for )  
related accounting and ratemaking )  
authorizations )  
\_\_\_\_\_ )

Case No. U-17429

PROOF OF SERVICE

STATE OF MICHIGAN )  
 ) SS  
COUNTY OF JACKSON )

Debra S. Weirich, being first duly sworn, deposes and says that she is employed in the Legal Department of Consumers Energy Company; that on September 27, 2013, she served a hard copy of the materials provided in response to discovery questions 17429-NCG-CE-295, 296, 298, 307, 308, 309, 314, 315 and 453, upon the persons noted below by depositing the same on September 27, 2013, in the United States mail in the City of Jackson, Michigan, with first-class postage thereon fully paid. She further states that she served an electronic copy of the discovery responses upon the persons listed in Attachment 1, with the exception of the Hon. Sharon L. Feldman, who received an electronic copy of the cover letter only, at feldmans@michigan.gov.

Rodger A. Kershner, Esq.  
Howard & Howard Attorneys PC  
450 West Fourth Street  
Royal Oak, MI 48067-2557

Jonathan Lesser  
6 Real Place  
Sandia Park, NM 87047

Alex Zakem  
Integrays Energy Services  
2211 Old Earhart, Suite 175  
Ann Arbor, MI 48105

\_\_\_\_\_  
Debra S. Weirich

Subscribed and sworn to before me this 27th day of September 2013.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Dorothy H. Wright, Notary Public  
State of Michigan, County of Jackson  
My Commission Expires: 08/17/19  
Acting in the County of Jackson

**ATTACHMENT 1 TO CASE NO. U-17429 - E-Mail Service List**

| <b>Party</b>                                                                                                                | <b>Name</b>                                                                                                                                                                                      | <b>E-mail Address</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Administrative Law Judge                                                                                                    | Hon. Sharon L. Feldman                                                                                                                                                                           | feldmans@michigan.gov                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| Counsel for the Michigan Public Service Commission Staff                                                                    | Amit T. Singh, Esq.<br>Spencer A. Sattler, Esq.                                                                                                                                                  | singha9@michigan.gov<br>sattlers@michigan.gov                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| Counsel for Energy Michigan, Inc. and FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.                                                           | Eric J. Schneidewind, Esq.<br>Timothy J. Lundgren, Esq.<br>Laura A. Chappelle, Esq.<br>Jacob McDermott, Esq.<br>Charlene Rericha<br>Brian Knipe<br>Lou D'Alessandris                             | ejschneidewind@varnumlaw.com<br>tjlundgren@varnumlaw.com<br>lachappelle@varnumlaw.com<br>jmcdermott@firstenergycorp.com<br>crericha@firstenergycorp.com<br>bknipe@firstenergycorp.com<br>ldalesandris@firstenergysolutions.com |
| Consultants for Energy Michigan, Inc.                                                                                       | Alex Zakem<br>Jonathan Lesser                                                                                                                                                                    | AJZakem@integrysenergy.com<br>jlesser@continentalecon.com                                                                                                                                                                      |
| Counsel for the Michigan State Utility Workers Council, Utility Workers Union of America, AFL-CIO                           | Steven D. Weyhing, Esq.                                                                                                                                                                          | sweyhing@wnj.com                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| Counsel for the Michigan Environmental Council ("MEC"), the Natural Resources Defense Council ("NRDC"), and the Sierra Club | Christopher M. Bzdok, Esq.<br>Emerson Hilton, Esq.<br>Ruth Ann Liebziet, Legal Asst.<br>Kimberly Flynn, Legal Asst.<br>James Clift<br>Rebecca Stanfield<br>Shannon Fisk, Esq.<br>Matthew Gerhart | chris@envlaw.com<br>emerson@envlaw.com<br>ruthann@envlaw.com<br>kimberly@envlaw.com<br>james@environmentalcouncil.org<br>rstanfield@nrdc.org<br>sfisk@earthjustice.org<br>mgerhart@earthjustice.org                            |
| Counsel for the Association of Businesses Advocating Tariff Equity (ABATE)                                                  | Robert A. W. Strong, Esq.                                                                                                                                                                        | rstrong@clarkhill.com                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| Consultant for the Association of Businesses Advocating Tariff Equity (ABATE)                                               | James T. Selecky                                                                                                                                                                                 | jtselucky@consultbai.com                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| Counsel for Midland Cogeneration Venture Limited Partnership ("MCV")                                                        | Richard J. Aaron, Esq.<br>Elinor R. Jordan, Esq.<br>David R. Whitfield, Esq.                                                                                                                     | raaron@wnj.com<br>ejordan@wnj.com<br>dwhitfield@wnj.com                                                                                                                                                                        |
| Counsel for Attorney General Bill Schuette                                                                                  | Donald E. Erickson, Esq.<br>John A. Janiszewski, Esq.                                                                                                                                            | ericksond@michigan.gov<br>janiszewskij2@michigan.gov                                                                                                                                                                           |
| Consultants for Attorney General Bill Schuette                                                                              | Michael J. McGarry, Sr.<br>Donna Mullinax<br>Dan Salter<br>Tracy Klaes                                                                                                                           | mmcgarry@blueridgecs.com<br>dmullinax@blueridgecs.com<br>dsalter@blueridgecs.com<br>tklaes@blueridgecs.com                                                                                                                     |
| Counsel for New Covert Generating Company, LLC                                                                              | Rodger A. Kershner, Esq.<br>Jon D. Kreucher, Esq.<br>Alex G. Cavanaugh, Esq..                                                                                                                    | RAK@h2law.com<br>JDK@h2law.com<br>ac@h2law.com                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| Counsel for Renaissance Power, L.L.C.                                                                                       | Jennifer Utter Heston, Esq.                                                                                                                                                                      | jheston@fraserlawfirm.com                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| Counsel for Energy Innovation Business Council                                                                              | Bruce Goodman, Esq.                                                                                                                                                                              | bgoodman@varnumlaw.com                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| Counsel for Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.                                                                                     | John M. Dempsey, Esq.<br>Brandon C. Hubbard, Esq.                                                                                                                                                | jdempsey@dickinsonwright.com<br>bhubbard@dickinsonwright.com                                                                                                                                                                   |