

STATE OF MICHIGAN
BEFORE THE MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

Case No. U-21870

In the matter of the application of
CONSUMERS ENERGY COMPANY
for authority to increase its rates for the
generation and distribution of electricity
and for other relief.

REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF

ELAINA M. BRAUNSCHWEIG

MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

October 21, 2025

**REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF
ELAINA M. BRAUNSCHEWIG
U-21870**

1 Q. Please state your name and business address.

2 A. My name is Elaina M. Braunschweig. Pronouns she/her. My business address is 7109
3 West Saginaw Hwy, Lansing, Michigan 48917.

4 Q. By whom are you employed and in what capacity?

5 A. I am employed by the Michigan Public Service Commission (MPSC or Commission) as a
6 Departmental Analyst for the Rates and Tariff Section of the Regulated Energy Division.

7 Q. Please describe your educational background.

8 A. In 2018, I completed my Bachelor of Arts dual-major in Economics & Management and
9 German with a minor in International Studies with honors from Albion College.

10 Q. What are your current responsibilities at the MPSC?

11 A. As an analyst, I participate in rate and tariff amendment cases under the direct
12 supervision of the Rates and Tariff manager. I am also responsible for coordinating tariff-
13 related *ex-parte* cases and the Rates and Tariff Section's connection to low-income
14 energy assistance and affordability. To that end, in July 2021, I began co-leading the
15 Affordability, Alignment, and Assistance subcommittee in the Commission's Energy
16 Affordability and Accessibility Collaborative and continue that to-date.

17 Q. Have you attended any seminars or other training courses relating to your current role?

18 A. Yes. In August 2021, I participated in Michigan State University's Institute of Public
19 Utilities Annual Regulatory Studies Program Fundamentals Course. In October 2021, I
20 attended Michigan State University's Institute of Public Utilities Advanced Cost
21 Allocation and Rate Design Course, and in February 2022, I attended EUCI's Electric
22 Utility Pricing Trends in Cost Recovery Course.

**REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF
ELAINA M. BRAUNSCHWEIG
U-21870**

1 Q. Have you previously presented testimony or participated in utility cases before the
2 MPSC?

3 A. Yes, I have presented testimony or otherwise participated in the following cases:

4	<u>Case No.</u>	<u>Company</u>	<u>Subject/Type</u>
5	U-20650	Consumers Energy	Gas Rate Design/Low-Income
6	U-20757	Commission	Low-Income Covid Report
7	U-20907	UMERC	Budget Billing Revisions
8	U-20929	DTE Energy	PSP Pilot Proposal
9	U-21021	Consumers Energy	PIPP Pilot Proposal
10	U-21148	Consumers Energy	Gas Rate Design/Low-Income
11	U-20836	DTE Energy	Low-Income Credits
12	U-21286	UPPCO	Low-Income Credits
13	U-21308	Consumers Energy	Gas Rate Design/Low-Income
14	U-21461	Indiana Michigan Power	Rate Design/Low-Income
15	U-21490	Consumers Energy	Gas Low-Income Credits
16	U-21291	DTE Gas	Low-Income Credits
17	U-21534	DTE Energy	Low-Income Credits
18	U-21585	Consumers Energy	Energy Affordability
19	U-21806	Consumers Energy	Low-Income Credits
20	U-21860	DTE Energy	Low-Income Credits

21 Q. What is the purpose and structure of your rebuttal testimony?

22 A. The purpose of my rebuttal testimony is to present Staff's response to certain positions
23 taken by the Urban Core Collective (UCC) witnesses Sergio Cira-Reyes and Tabitha
24 Williams.

25 Q. Please summarize relevant recommendations from UCC witnesses Cira-Reyes and
26 Williams.

27 A. In direct testimony, UCC witnesses Cira-Reyes and Williams recommended the
28 Commission approve a percentage of income payment plan (PIPP).¹

¹ Direct Testimony of UCC witness Sergio Cira-Reyes, p. 46; Direct Testimony of UCC witness Tabitha Williams, p. 31.

**REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF
ELAINA M. BRAUNSCHWEIG
U-21870**

1 Q. What evidence does Staff present in response to the UCC recommendations?

2 A. Staff cites the statute MCL 460.11(2), and its corresponding eligibility criteria outlined in
3 MCL 460.10t(6)(b).

4 Staff additionally cites the DTE Electric rate case order issued by the Commission in
5 MPSC Case No. U-21534, in which the Commission states: “Therefore, the Commission
6 finds that the LIA credit should be increased to \$50. However, the Commission finds that
7 after final decisions and recommendations are provided by the EAAC, the Commission
8 may continue to refine the LIA program in the future, including potentially changing the
9 amount of this credit.”² LIA stands for the low-income assistance credit. EAAC stands
10 for the Energy Affordability and Accessibility Collaborative. The Commission reaffirmed
11 its position in Consumers Electric’s rate case, MPSC Case No. U-21585, by disallowing
12 large-scale energy assistance reform as well in stating: “However, the Commission agrees
13 with the Staff that the instant rate case is not the appropriate forum for such policy
14 modifications. As already noted by the ALJ, the Commission is currently reviewing low-
15 income programs in numerous forums, including in the EAAC and EWR plan
16 proceedings.”³ EWR stands for energy waste reduction.

17 Q. How has Staff worked to fulfill the cited Commission orders?

18 A. During the pendency of this instant case, Staff filed its Energy Affordability Report in
19 MPSC Case No. U-20757 on 9/10/2025.

20 Q. Do UCC witnesses raise issues and make recommendations that overlap with content in

² MPSC Case No. U-21534, 1/23/25 Commission Order, p. 405.

³ MPSC Case No. U-21585, 3/21/25 Commission Order, p. 391.

**REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF
ELAINA M. BRAUNSCHEIG
U-21870**

1 MPSC Staff's Energy Affordability Report?

2 A. Yes, there are topics and recommendations in witness testimonies in the instant case that
3 could overlap, conflict, or agree with the MPSC Staff Energy Affordability Report.

4 Seeing as the Commission's last stated position directed energy assistance and
5 affordability reform to disseminate from that report/the EAAC, Staff recommends the
6 Commission take a consistent approach and align its decisions with the Staff report as it
7 addresses the intervenor recommendations in the instant case.

8 **Summary**

9 Q. Please summarize your positions and recommendations in your rebuttal testimony.

10 A. Staff provides notice of filing its report on energy affordability and PIPPs, as requested
11 by the Commission in MPSC Case No. U-21534. This report addresses many of the
12 issues raised in testimonies provided by intervening party witnesses and Staff
13 recommends the Commission align its decisions with the Staff report as it addresses the
14 intervenor recommendations in the instant case.

15 Q. Does this conclude your rebuttal testimony?

16 A. Yes, it does.

STATE OF MICHIGAN
BEFORE THE MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

* * * * *

**In the matter of the application of)
CONSUMERS ENERGY COMPANY)
for authority to increase its rates for the)
distribution of electricity and for other relief.)**
_____)

Case No. U-21870

PROOF OF SERVICE

Jillian Bowden, being duly sworn, deposes and says that on October 21, 2025, A.D., she emailed a copy of the attached MPSC rebuttal testimony to the persons as shown on the attached list.

Jillian Bowden

Jillian Bowden

Subscribed and sworn to before me this
21st day of October 2025.

Michelle L. Conarton, Notary Public
State of Michigan, County of Ingham
Acting in the County of Eaton
My Commission Expires: 6-18-2026

Consumers Energy Company:

Spencer Sattler
Mark Ruskiewicz
Gary Gensch, Jr.
Evan Keimach
Bret Totoraitis
Anne Uitvlugt
spencer.sattler@cmsenergy.com
mark.ruskiewicz@cmsenergy.com
gary.genschjr@cmsenergy.com
evan.keimach@cmsenergy.com
bret.totoraitis@cmsenergy.com
anne.uitvlugt@cmsenergy.com
kelly.hall@cmsenergy.com
mpsc.filings@cmsenergy.com

MPSC Staff:

Daniel Sonneveldt
Amit Singh
Michael Orris
Nicholas Taylor
Alena Clark
Adam Cozort
Lori Mayabb
sonneveldtd@michigan.gov
singha9@michigan.gov
orrism@michigan.gov
taylor10@michigan.gov
clarkaa55@michigan.gov
cozort1@michigan.gov
mayabbl@michigan.gov

ALJ:

Jonathan F. Thoits
thoitsj@michigan.gov

Michigan Cable Telecommunications Association:

Sean Gallagher
Jon Austin
sgallagher@fraserlawfirm.com
jaustin@fraserlawfirm.com

AG:

Celeste R. Gill
Lucas Wollenzien
gillc1@michigan.gov
wollenzienl@michigan.gov
ag-enra-spec-lit@michigan.gov
Sebastian Coppola
sebpcoppola@corpolytics.com

**Michigan Environmental Council
Natural Resources Defense Council**

Sierra Club

Citizens Utility Board of Michigan:

Christopher Bzdok
Tracy Jane Andrews
Holly Hillyer
Natasha Fowles
Jackson Neme
Tanya Stasio
Jordan Burt
Tyler Comings
Caroline Palmer
Rick Bunch
Julielyn Gibbons
Matt Bandyk
Sean Clark
chris@tropospherelegal.com
tjandrews@tropospherelegal.com
holly@tropospherelegal.com
natasha@tropospherelegal.com
jackson@tropospherelegal.com
tanya.stasio@aeclinic.org
tyler.comings@aeclinic.org
cpalmer@synapse-energy.com
rbunch@5lakesenergy.com
jgibbons@5lakesenergy.com
mbandyk@synapse-energy.com
sean@tropospherelegal.com
jordan.burt@aeclinic.org

Citizens Utility Board:

John Liskey
john@liskeypllc.com

**Association of Businesses Advocating
Tariff Equity:**

Benjamin Holwerda
Stephen Campbell
Michael Pattwell
Lauren Degnan
Jim Dauphinais
Jessica York
Christina Hildebrandt
bholwerda@clarkhill.com
scampbell@clarkhill.com
mpattwell@clarkhill.com
ldegan@clarkhill.com
jdauphinais@consultbai.com
jyork@consultbai.com
childebrandt@consultbai.com

The Kroger Company:

Kurt Boehm
Jody Kyler Cohn
Michael Kurtz
kboehm@BKLawfirm.com
jkylereohn@BKLawfirm.com
m Kurtz@BKLawfirm.com
Justin Bieber
jbieber@energystrat.com

**Hemlock Semiconductor Operations,
LLC and Solar Technology LLC.:**

Jennifer Heston
jheston@potomac-law.com

Walmart, Inc.:

Melissa Horne
mhorne@hcc-law.com

**Environmental Law & Policy Center
Ecology Center; Vote Solar; Union of
Concerned Scientists:**

Daniel Abrams
Katie Duckworth
dabrams@elpc.org
kduckworth@elpc.org
mpscdocket@elpc.org
Alondra Estrada
Katie Toolan
astrada@elpc.org
ktoolan@elpc.org

**Great Lakes Renewable Energy
Association:**

Don Keskey
donkeskey@publiclawresourcecenter.com

**Michigan Electric Transmission
Company:**

Richard Aaron
Courtney Kissel
Olivia Flower
Hannah E. Buzolits
raaron@dykema.com
ckissel@dykema.com
oflower@dykema.com
hbuzolits@dykema.com
mpscfilings@dykema.com

Urban Core Collective:

Mark Templeton
Jacob Schuhardt
Emma Young
Alexandria Miskho
Heidi Peng
Willow Perlick
Aashney Shah
templeton@uchicago.edu
jschuhardt@uchicago.edu
eyoung28@uchicago.edu
amiskho@uchicago.edu
hhpeng@lawclinic.uchicago.edu
willowperlick@lawclinic.uchicago.edu
aashney@lawclinic.uchicago.edu
aelc_mpsc@lawclinic.uchicago.edu

Energy Michigan, Inc.:

**Michigan Energy Innovation Business
Council; Institute for Energy
Innovation Advanced Energy United;
Foundry Association of Michigan:**
Laura Chappelle
Timothy Lundgren
Justin Ooms
lachappelle@varnumlaw.com
tjlundgren@varnumlaw.com
jkooms@varnumlaw.com