



Stephen A. Campbell  
T (313) 309-4274  
F (313) 309-6882  
Email:SCampbell@ClarkHill.com

Clark Hill  
500 Woodward Avenue, Suite 3500  
Detroit, MI 48226  
T 313.965.8300  
F 313.965.8252

September 2, 2025

**VIA ELECTRONIC CASE FILING**

Executive Secretary  
Michigan Public Service Commission  
7109 W. Saginaw Highway  
Lansing, Michigan 48917

**Re: Case No. U-21829 – In the matter of the application of Consumers Energy Company to commence a renewable energy cost reconciliation proceeding for the 12-month period ended December 31, 2024.**

Dear Executive Secretary:

Enclosed for filing please find the **Association of Businesses Advocating Tariff Equity's Petition to Intervene** and **Proof of Service** in the above-referenced matter.

Sincerely,

**CLARK HILL PLC**

Stephen A.  
Campbell

Stephen A. Campbell

Digitally signed by: Stephen A. Campbell  
DN: CN = Stephen A. Campbell email =  
SCampbell@clarkhill.com C = US O =  
Clark Hill PLC  
Date: 2025.09.02 14:15:45 -04'00'

SAC/lkd  
cc: Parties of Record

**STATE OF MICHIGAN**  
**BEFORE THE MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION**

\* \* \* \* \*

In the matter of the application of )	
<b>CONSUMERS ENERGY COMPANY</b> )	Case No. U-21829
to commence a renewable energy cost )	
reconciliation proceeding for the 12-month )	ALJ James M. Varchetti
period ended December 31, 2024. )	
_____ )	

**PETITION TO INTERVENE OF THE**  
**ASSOCIATION OF BUSINESSES ADVOCATING TARIFF EQUITY**

The Association of Businesses Advocating Tariff Equity (“ABATE”), by and through its attorneys, Clark Hill PLC, hereby petitions the Michigan Public Service Commission (“Commission”) for leave to intervene in the captioned proceeding pursuant to Mich Admin Code, R 792.10410 (“Rule 410”) of the Commission’s Rules of Practice and Procedure. In support of this petition, ABATE states as follows:

1. ABATE is a voluntary association of large industrial companies that conduct business throughout the state of Michigan. The primary purpose of ABATE is to participate in state and federal regulatory proceedings to protect the interests of businesses in connection with energy and utility matters. To that end, ABATE consistently advocates for cost-of-service based energy rates, equitable terms of service, and increased access to a competitive energy market. ABATE is also interested in assuring that rates, surcharges, and conditions of service are adopted in conformance with the law and in a fair and reasonable manner.

2. Collectively, ABATE’s members employ nearly 100,000 Michiganders and spend approximately \$1.5 billion on energy and related services in Michigan each year. As the representative of such large users of electricity, natural gas, and transportation services, ABATE

is vitally interested in achieving increased economic efficiencies for the utilities that serve its members.

3. Present members of ABATE include: Cleveland Cliffs, Cargill, Inc., Charles River Laboratories, Corning, Inc., Edward C. Levy Co., Enbridge Energy, Limited Partnership, Ervin Industries Inc., Stellantis, Gerdau MacSteel INC., General Motors LLC, Graphic Packaging International, Inc., Hemlock Semiconductor Operations LLC, J. Rettenmaier USA LP, Marathon Petroleum Company LP, Martin Marietta Magnesia Specialties LLC, Metal Technologies, Inc., Occidental Chemical Corporation, Pfizer Inc., The Dow Chemical Company, Linde, Inc., United States Gypsum Company, WestRock California, Inc., and Zoetis LLC.

4. ABATE members are directly impacted by the issues raised in this proceeding and have a substantial interest therein because ABATE members are concerned about the proposals made in Consumers Energy Company (“Consumers” or “Company”)’s Application, including its request that the Commission approve the reconciliation of its renewable energy plan costs for the period beginning January 1, 2024 through December 31, 2024, as well as its “Transfer Price Cost” as described in the Application.

5. Although Rule 410 speaks in terms of *leave to intervene*, the Commission has indicated that it considers the ability to intervene to be one of right when a petitioner can meet the two-prong test for standing.<sup>1</sup> This test requires a showing that the prospective intervenor will: (1) suffer an injury in fact as a result of the outcome of the case; and (2) the interests allegedly

---

<sup>1</sup> The United States Supreme Court established the two-prong test for standing in *Association of Data Processing Service Organizations, Inc v Camp*, 397 US 150; 90 S Ct 827; 25 L Ed 2d 184 (1970), applied to utility matters in *Drake v The Detroit Edison Co*, 453 F Supp 1123, 1127 (WD Mich, 1978), and adopted by the Commission in its November 10, 1988 Order in Case No. U-9138.

endangered fall within the zone of interests intended to be protected or regulated by the statute or constitutional guarantee in question.<sup>2</sup>

6. ABATE meets the two-prong test for standing because, as customers of the Company, ABATE members have a direct financial interest in the amount, rates, terms, programs, and conditions of service for the Company's customers. If authorized by the Commission, the proposals set forth in the Company's Application will have a direct and adverse impact on the rates that ABATE members pays. ABATE's interest in the adoption of reasonable and prudent utility rates falls within the zone of interests to be protected by the Commission's consideration of the issues in this proceeding.

7. In addition to meeting the conditions for intervention by right, ABATE meets the Commission's criteria for permissive intervention. As recognized in prior Commission orders, "the Commission's discretion to grant leave to intervene is broader than the two-prong test . . . Unlike a court of law, an administrative agency can allow intervention whenever the resulting delay will likely be outweighed by the benefit of the intervenor's participation."<sup>3</sup> Permissive intervention has also been granted where a proceeding "raises novel questions and important issues of policy" and the intervenor will "bring a unique perspective" to the case.<sup>4</sup>

8. ABATE has regularly participated in electric and natural gas proceedings before the Commission and federal regulatory bodies for over three decades. As in prior cases, ABATE will provide the Commission with useful and unique information through the testimony of its

---

<sup>2</sup> *In re Consumers Energy for authority to implement a power supply cost recovery plan*, MPSC Case No. U-17317, March 6, 2014, Order, p 4 (emphasis added).

<sup>3</sup> *In re Michigan Consolidated for authority to increase its rates*, MPSC Case No. U-10150, December 8, 1992, Order, p 5.

<sup>4</sup> *In re Consumers Energy to fully comply with Public Act 295 of 2008*, MPSC Case No. U-17771, October 27, 2015, Order, p 6, citing *In re Mascotech Forming Technologies*, MPSC Case No. U-11057, June 5, 1996, Order, pp 2-3.

experts. ABATE will also scrutinize the reasonableness and prudence of the Company's proposals through necessary and appropriate means. These efforts will assist the Commission in making significant policy determinations in this case and will "bring helpful information to the Commission's attention that might not otherwise be available."<sup>5</sup> As such, ABATE meets the test for permissive intervention.

9. ABATE will carefully examine the reasonableness and prudence of the Company's requests and proposals, including those indicated above.

10. ABATE will take the position that the Company's Application, including but not limited to the proposals described above, should be carefully scrutinized and any unjustified, unsubstantiated, imprudent, unreasonable, or unlawful deficiencies, costs, proposals, or mechanisms should be disallowed.

11. ABATE will seek an order in this proceeding approving rates, terms, programs, and conditions of service which are just, fair, reasonable, and lawful.

12. The interests of ABATE and its members are not adequately represented by the present parties and, therefore, it would be detrimental to the public interest to deny this Petition to Intervene.

13. ABATE reserves the right to take other positions and/or seek other relief based on a review of the various filings, the responses to discovery, or positions taken in briefs.

**WHEREFORE**, ABATE requests that the Commission grant ABATE's Petition to Intervene in and be treated as a full party hereto. ABATE further requests that the parties serve

---

<sup>5</sup> *In the Matter, on the Commission's own motion*, MPSC Case No. U-18091, February 21, 2019, Order, p 9.

copies of all pleadings and correspondence in these proceedings to the offices of its counsel listed below and to its consultant(s):

Brubaker & Associates  
James Dauphinais  
[jdauphinais@consultbai.com](mailto:jdauphinais@consultbai.com)

Respectfully submitted,

**CLARK HILL PLC**

**Stephen A.**

By: **Campbell**

Digitally signed by: Stephen A. Campbell  
DN: CN = Stephen A. Campbell email =  
SCampbell@clarkhill.com C = US O =  
Clark Hill PLC  
Date: 2025.09.02 14:16:02 -04'00'

Michael J. Pattwell (P72419)  
Stephen A. Campbell (P76684)  
Attorneys for the Association of  
Businesses Advocating Tariff Equity  
Clark Hill PLC  
500 Woodward, Suite 3500  
Detroit, Michigan 48226  
(313) 309-4274  
[mpattwell@clarkhill.com](mailto:mpattwell@clarkhill.com)  
[scampbell@clarkhill.com](mailto:scampbell@clarkhill.com)

Date: September 2, 2025

STATE OF MICHIGAN

BEFORE THE MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

\* \* \* \* \*

In the matter of the application of )  
**CONSUMERS ENERGY COMPANY,** )  
to commence a renewable energy cost )  
reconciliation proceeding for the 12-month )  
period ended December 31, 2024. )  
\_\_\_\_\_ )

Case No. U-21829

ALJ James M. Varchetti

**PROOF OF SERVICE**

STATE OF MICHIGAN )  
 ) ss  
COUNTY OF WAYNE )

Stephen A. Campbell, being first duly sworn, deposes and says that on September 2, 2025, he did cause to be served the *Association of Businesses Advocating Tariff Equity's Petition to Intervene*, as well as this *Proof of Service*, in the above docket, via electronic mail, to the persons identified on the attached service list.

Stephen A.  
Campbell

Digitally signed by: Stephen A. Campbell  
DN: CN = Stephen A. Campbell email =  
SCampbell@clarkhill.com C = US O = Clark  
Hill PLC  
Date: 2025.09.02 14:16:21 -04'00'

\_\_\_\_\_  
Stephen A. Campbell

**SERVICE LIST**  
**MPSC Case No. U-21829**

<p><b>Administrative Law Judge</b>  Hon. James M. Varchetti  Administrative Law Judge  Michigan Public Service Commission  7109 W. Saginaw Hwy., 3rd Floor  Lansing, Michigan 48917  Email: <a href="mailto:varchettij@michigan.gov">varchettij@michigan.gov</a></p>	<p><b>Counsel for MPSC Staff</b>  Anna B. Stirling  Heather M.S. Durian  Email: <a href="mailto:stirlinga1@michigan.gov">stirlinga1@michigan.gov</a>  <a href="mailto:durianh@michigan.gov">durianh@michigan.gov</a>    Lori Mayabb  Email: <a href="mailto:mayabbl@michigan.gov">mayabbl@michigan.gov</a></p>
<p><b>Consumers Energy Company</b>  Gary A. Gensch  Kelly Hall  Anne M. Uitvlugt  Email: <a href="mailto:gary.genschjr@cmsenergy.com">gary.genschjr@cmsenergy.com</a>  <a href="mailto:Kelly.hall@cmsenergy.com">Kelly.hall@cmsenergy.com</a>  <a href="mailto:anne.uitvlugt@cmsenergy.com">anne.uitvlugt@cmsenergy.com</a>  <a href="mailto:mpsc.filings@cmsenergy.com">mpsc.filings@cmsenergy.com</a></p>	<p>Counsel for Michigan Environmental Council  Holly L. Hillyer  Christopher M. Bzdok  Email: <a href="mailto:holly@tropospherelegal.com">holly@tropospherelegal.com</a>  <a href="mailto:chris@tropospherelegal.com">chris@tropospherelegal.com</a></p>
<p><b>Counsel for ABATE</b>  Michael J. Pattwell  Stephen A. Campbell  Email: <a href="mailto:mpattwell@clarkhill.com">mpattwell@clarkhill.com</a>  <a href="mailto:scampbell@clarkhill.com">scampbell@clarkhill.com</a>    Lauren Degnan  Email: <a href="mailto:ldegnan@clarkhill.com">ldegnan@clarkhill.com</a></p>	<p><b>Consultants for ABATE</b>  James Dauphinais  Email: <a href="mailto:jdauphinais@consultbai.com">jdauphinais@consultbai.com</a></p>